BOOK REVIEW JULY 18, 2025

Between Chaos and Order

ALLEN MENDENHALL

Richard Kopley captures Edgar Allan Poe's tragic assessment of the world.

DEATH CAME TO EDGAR ALLAN POE MUCH AS IT HAD TO the doomed characters who haunted his tales of the grotesque: strangely, symbolically, and shrouded in ambiguity. It is fitting that we should begin there, in that Baltimore setting where the mystery still clings like fog to the facts. "The subject [of Poe's death] is famously fraught," writes Richard Kopley. Within that careful academic phrase lies the whole terrible admission of our inability to grasp the ultimate meaning of a man who lived always at the edge of meaning itself.

Kopley, distinguished professor emeritus at Penn State DuBois, has given us *Edgar Allan Poe: A Life*, a monumental biography spanning 714 pages,

nearly a quarter of them devoted to endnotes, as if even these might contain buried clues. The final details, however, are as enigmatic and horrible as Poe's greatest stories.

Poe died on October 7, 1840, at forty years old, that fatal age when a man's devils either claim him or release their hold forever. On September 26, he had parted company with two fellow writers, John M. Daniel and John R. Thompson, reportedly in "high spirits." At half past nine that evening, he encountered Dr. John F. Carter; then he dined with relations who claimed he was sober when midnight struck, and he took his leave. Next, the steamboat at four in the morning carried him into the void.

"At this point, on board the vessel," Kopley says, "Poe needed someone with him—a friend and protector, someone who would watch out for him. He should not have been alone." But alone he was, just as in many ways he had ever been. "We lose sight of Poe for several days," Kopley writes. "There is uncertainty; there is mystery." Poe, in his last hours, lived out the genre he had perfected, stepping across that threshold between the teller and the told.

What followed seems like a collaboration between Poe and his inner demons. Kopley's chronology staggers under the weight of conflicting testimonies, but a recognizable plot emerges: On October 3, witnesses beheld a man stupefied and struggling, stripped of his clothes like the victim of theft, semiconscious and delirious. The hospital received him in the grip of apparent mania. Tranquilized, he surfaced briefly into consciousness only to speak incoherently to his doctor, his mind already half-departed. The vigil lasted four days, his condition spiraling downward until October 7 brought his last words: "Lord help my poor soul."

Here, Kopley offers his most penetrating observation: "For years, Poe had integrated his life in his work—perhaps now, at the end, Poe was integrating his work in his life." This is a creative way of saying what every astute reader of Poe already knows: that the boundary between the man and his creations had long since dissolved, that he had written himself into existence as surely as he had written his characters, and that his

demise was simply the conclusive revision of a text he had been composing his entire career.

Poe represents a peculiar Southern type who wears the mask of gentility while something altogether more desperate writhes beneath: Andrew Jackson with his dueling pistols, Jesse James with his bank robberies that were somehow rituals of honor, Doc Holliday coughing blood into his cards, Faulkner drowning his demons in bourbon and prose, Walker Percy stalking purpose through the ruins of Christendom. These figures carried a distinct burden: the knowledge that civilization is a thin veneer, that beneath the courtly manners and code of honor lies an abyss that no amount of breeding can fill. They were refined men who peered into the darkness and found it looking back at them.

Poe's origins, however, were far from privileged, despite the education he would later receive. Born in Boston to thespian parents—his mother a gifted actress, his father considerably less talented—Poe was orphaned at the age of three. He was subsequently raised by John Allan, a wealthy Richmond merchant who provided him with a gentleman's education but never legally adopted him.

> The horrible chaos that pulses through Poe's work demanded of him the most laborious plotting and organization; they are creatures of deliberate design even as they mime disorder.

Poe's academic promise was evident during his time at the University of Virginia, where he distinguished himself scholastically. However, financial troubles—stemming from his complicated relationship with his foster father—forced him to leave before completing his studies. The boy who had been raised in comfort but never security found himself back in Boston, the city of his birth and first exile, enlisting in the Army while his pen began to earn modest victories. Even then, as success beckoned however faintly, his relationship with Allan crumbled, one of many such collapses that would define his life.

For a man who passed away at forty, there is much to recount: the War of 1812, which impacted his early years, and the development of a young republic as he shaped his own identity. But the essential pattern was established early and never varied: death as his constant companion, loss as his most faithful muse. The toll call reads like a sad litany: not merely his parents in those first difficult years, but Jane Stanard, the young woman who awakened his poetic sensibilities, and then his older brother William, claimed by the same consumption that had taken his mother. But it was the passing of Virginia Clemm Poe that broke something in him beyond repair.

She had been both his wife and first cousin. Kopley highlights the much-discussed, troubling detail: "The printed document for the marriage bond stated that the bride was twenty-one years old, but she was actually thirteen." Poe himself was twenty-six. For just over a decade, they lived as man and wife, until tuberculosis claimed her, too. After Virginia's death, his drinking grew worse, his melancholy deepened, and the genius who had written so eloquently of premature burial began to live as if he had been buried alive himself.

We may think we know Poe from our schooldays. We can recall, if not recite, “The Raven,” “Annabel Lee,” “The Bells.” We remember the fiction that made us shiver: “The Fall of the House of Usher,” “The Masque of the Red Death,” “The Pit and the Pendulum,” “The Premature Burial,” “The Purloined Letter,” “The Cask of Amontillado,” “The Tell-Tale Heart.” Yet Kopley’s book inspired this reviewer to return to these familiar texts with adult eyes, and the shock of recognition was profound. What seemed merely odd during my youth appeared far more disturbing to the middle-aged me: the work of a suffering mind that had stared too long into the fundamental dread of existence and found there not chaos but a sickening order, not meaninglessness but a meaning too precise and pitiless to bear.

This claim may seem at odds with an earlier statement, since describing a sickening order and a meaning too precise and pitiless to bear seems to conflict with the claim that civilization is only a thin veneer concealing an abyss no breeding can fill. One vision presents the universe as grimly systematic, bound by terrifying determinism; the other suggests chaos, the void, nothingness itself. Yet in Poe, these are not opposites but twins, for the abyss reveals itself as sickening order, and both chaos and cruel systems alike serve as wellsprings of dread. The horrible chaos that pulses through Poe’s work demanded of him the most laborious plotting and organization; they are creatures of deliberate design even as they mime disorder.

Take Poe’s “The Visionary,” which Kopley dubs “a rich tale, comprising two sections.” Here, Poe shows civilization as a mask of elegance and ritual stretched thin over the abyss of despair and doom. The Marchesa Bianca (so named in the original version of the story) moves through Venetian nobility with grace, but her beauty and station are veils drawn over quiet suffering, emotional burial, and death’s approach. Her bond with the mysterious rescuer (aesthete and fatalist) unfolds not in open speech but through silent signs, missed moments, and a final meeting as formal as it is fatal.

The adorned setting—palaces, canals, ornaments—only deepens the mockery of human artifice before a universe ruled by merciless precision. The rescuer’s death by poison is no random despair but a calculated surrender to a fate he has long foreseen. His meeting with the Marchesa

bears the weight of tragic inevitability, doomed not by chance but by the very architecture of Poe's world, one where beauty, longing, and death are chained by inescapable, pitiless order. Beneath culture's illusion lies decay's certainty. The story thus works a double horror: civilization as brittle pretense, and the universe as a stage whose script was written before the curtain rose.

Kopley's research is formidable. He's assembled a vast chorus of primary sources, weaving quotations in and out of his narrative with such relentless thoroughness that his own voice sometimes disappears entirely beneath the accumulated testimony of witnesses, critics, and correspondents. His is scholarship by accretion, truth by documentary saturation, as if the sheer weight of evidence might pin down a man who spent his life eluding definition.

Yet perhaps this method is fitting for Poe, who was always more echo than substance, more shadow than flesh—a riddle best understood through the voices of others, the traces he left in letters and reviews, as well as the memories of those who knew him briefly and incompletely.

REVIEWED

Edgar Allan Poe

by Richard Kopley

BUY THIS TITLE

Allen Mendenhall is a senior advisor for the Capital Markets Initiative at the Heritage Foundation. A lawyer with a PhD in English from Auburn

University, he has taught at multiple colleges and universities across Alabama and is the author or editor of nine books. Learn more at AllenMendenhall.com.

Law & Liberty is an online magazine published by Liberty Fund and committed to a society of free and responsible persons living under the rule of law. We publish essays, book reviews, podcasts, and forum debates that elevate discourse on law, policy, political theory, economics, education, and culture, all with an eye to understanding and cultivating a free society.

LAW & LIBERTY

PART OF THE LIBERTY FUND NETWORK